

Town of Arlington, Massachusetts 730 Massachusetts Ave., Arlington, MA 02476 Phone: 781-316-3000

webmaster@town.arlington.ma.us

06/24/2010 Minutes

June 24, 2010 Whittemore Robbins House

Final and Approved Minutes

Commissioners

Present: A. Frisch, D. Levy, S. Makowka, J. Nyberg, T. Smurzynski, J. Worden

Commissioners

Not Present: D. Baldwin, B. Cohen, M. Logan, M. Penzenik

Guests: T. White, J. Leone, J. Metzger, G. Metzger, E. Metzger, J. Fleming

1. **AHDC Meeting Opens**

Appointment of alternate Commissioners; Pleasant Street - A. Frisch, D. Levy, T. Smurzynsky, S. Makowka; Mt. Gilboa/Crescent Hill - A. Frisch, T. Smurzynski, S. Makowka; Russell - A. Frisch, D. Levy, T. Śmurzynski; Avon Place - A. Frisch, D. Levy, T. Smurzynski, S. Makowka

8:00pm

- 3. Approval of minutes from May 27, 2010 meeting; S. Makowka moved approval, approved unanimously.
- Communications
- S. Makowka received call from C. Kowalski from Planning Dept. re: 239 Pleasant Street about possibility of demolishing property. C. Greeley also received call from individual about same issue and directed them to Design Guidelines.
- 5. **New Business**

8:20pm

Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 204 Pleasant Street (White) re: renovations. Applicant (T. White, architect, and J. Leone, attorney, appearing on behalf of applicant) stated that there have been some changes in the plans based on Commission feedback. Applicant recapped scope of project: Converting original 3 family house to single family property; asbestos & aluminum siding being removed and being replaced with clapboard siding; this is the last phase and they're looking at front facing Pleasant Street; creating more formal entrance way in to house; taking apartment stairway away; want to take down non original 2 car carport and replacing with 3 bay garage in its place.

Applicant noted several areas of concern identified by Commission – stone cladding, presence of cupola, height of proposed structure, and lack of confirmed window specifications. They propose to lower the new garage roof another foot to create subordinate relationship between barn structure and garage, eliminate the cupola, and remove stone cladding which is replaced with flat board and batton siding. Applicant also provided visual rendering of proposed structure on photographs of site. S. Makowka said existing garage 29 feet from property line and new garage would be 10 feet from the property line. S. Makowka asked if the existing stone wall will stay. Applicant said it will stay because of location of existing patio area. The plans show from the floor of the garage up, what will foundation look like? Applicant stated that siding will follow grade and wrap the corner and transition in to stone wall. J. Nyberg asked if there's enough turn radius to get in to the garages. There's about 30 feet between the vegetation and the entrance to get in to the garage. They extended a paved area in to the front wall so that cars can back out. Stone wall is being cut around the trees. S. Makowka said we don't have jurisdiction over landscaping. J. Leone asked if we have jurisdiction over the "view". D. Levy feels this is much better than before and it is still a fantastic looking garage. Preference would be to do carport on 3rd bay and not because of the view but because having a 3 bay garage right

there in the front feels heavy and perhaps having a carport on the end would lighten it up. Applicant said he thinks you might have a different feeling if you didn't have the photographs but when looking at it 3D it feels right and in proportion to the existing structure. J. Worden commented that he still thinks the roof looks awkward and raised the idea of clipping the garage roof to create hip at the end. Applicant has not drawn this option yet. In response to further questions, applicant stated that doors will be custom made out of painted cedar; they are lift up doors made to look like carriage house doors; windows proposed are Marvin Ultimate double hung – all wood, no cladding, 7/8 inch simulated divided light; the 3 windows facing neighbor's property will be same wood windows with divided lights (will replicate existing 6 over 6 and make 2 windows to match); and set of French doors will be installed in place of 2 windows on back façade facing pond.
D. Levy moved approval of plans as proposed including new 3 car garage and with changes from original proposal including new siding around entranceway, lowering height of roof, removal of cupola over garage, etc. -- seconded by J. Worden for discussion. S. Makowka asked about the option of a hip roof. Others felt leave as proposed, J. Worden deferred to opinion of other Commissioners. Motion approved unanimously as described in application as modified by revised plans and material specifications submitted at hearing on 6/24/10 for removal of existing garage and replacement with 3 new car garage, removal of apartment entrance and egress stair, change of siding treatment near front door and addition of French doors. M. Penzenik will continue as monitor. S. Makowka noted that the fact that this proposed structure is so depressed from the street level creates unique site specific circumstances supporting approval of this application.

- Formal Hearing re: 114 Westminster Ave. (Fleming/Metzger) re: exterior renovations. S. Makowka noted that many of the elements of the proposals are eligible for a CONA. Applicant is also proposing to replace a couple of metal sliding windows on small addition as well as windows on main house massing. The applicant stated that the sliders are not original, however, rest of windows may be original wood elsewhere throughout house. The Commissioners stated that, per the guidelines, the Commissions preference is to maintain existing elements of houses including restoring existing original. A question was asked about the proposed windows: Are they true divided light? A Commissioner noted the attached manufacturer's specifications for Marvin Ultimate window series listed prefinished metal clad exterior. J. Worden said getting rid of sliders is good idea and replicating casing on other windows is good idea. Replacing sliders with multi-pane double hung sash windows is good, but other original windows being replaced are not so good. Preference is if original windows in place that they be repaired if at all possible. Applicant said replacing sliders is not dictating the rest of the project. Applicant's father was present and he suggested eliminating storm windows and replacing windows. House was built in 1926. Applicant noted they are also proposing addition of two other windows also. J. Worden is focusing on front elevation of house. D. Levy suggested middle ground of single glazed on front of house and alternatives on other sides of house. The Commissioners noted that proposed changes on back of house are visible but are relatively less prominent so there may be more flexibility for those locations. The Commission also noted that the Marvin Ultimates proposed are insert type units which by their design changes the dimension of the windows. Applicant explained that the single window located on the rear top floor (to the right) is visible from Westcourt Terrace and that they would like to create a double window at this location. Also proposing a installation of a second small window addition on the north façade and is slightly visible from the sidewalk. S. Makowka said that the small window's proportion is fine - rear of house is visible but almost like an alley way. Still visible but can be more flexible with the façade. With French doors, the new pair balances them. He summarized an option available to the applicant: Keep and repair front single glazed and replace storms. Alternatively, repair and replacement option using like materials (true divided lite wood windows) is something that can be done under a CONA. He feels that small window addition and replacement of pair on back with replacement window would be OK because of the façade. Would request high transparency option on exterior screen for these windows. A. Frisch moved approval as described in application and accompanying documentation, replacement of metal sliding windows on front and rear of side addition, replacement of small metal basement window on front façade, installation of replacement windows on 2nd floor of rear façade, windows on front facade to be restored, not replaced. All windows approved to be consistent with Commission guidelines: Marvin Ultimate Windows (As proposed), 6 over 1 Double Hung (except small windows), all wood (no cladding) simulated divided lights with internal spacers, etc. It is noted that the Commission's preference is that applicant consider repair of existing windows and use of historically appropriate single paned windows in place of windows approved herein. Seconded by J. Nyberg. Voted unanimously in favor. Monitor appointed J. Nyberg.
- c. Formal Hearing re: 33 Russell Street (Littlewood) re: exterior renovations. Applicant W. Littlewood was present. He is looking at significant amount of repairs and is requesting feedback from the Commission not seeking certificate at this point. His intention is to replace like with like with couple of exceptions. Some original wood gutters on second floor already replaced with copper gutters. Now 1st Floor wood gutters are in very poor shape and need to be replaced. He asked the Commission about us what the available options are contractors have said wood gutters today don't last and applicant asked about synthetic gutters. S. Makowka told him the synthetic gutters are no longer available due to problems with past installations. Copper gutters could be a fruitful course to pursue. J. Nyberg said he might like to see the volume of the wood gutters as compared to the copper. Also looking at first floor roofs (now big wide asphalt sheets), makes sense to replace that and would love to put copper up there but probably very expensive. J. Worden said he has a ternplate roof on his porch. Recently recoated with a rubbberized paint option instead of copper; there are also standing seam roofs. S. Makowka said this roof is really flat (not visible from street) and he would suggest rubber roof. Re: insulation we don't have jurisdiction. Applicant asked about lattice and skirt

apron - thinking of imitation wood because of proximity to ground. Commission suggested wood components as well as use of "thick privacy lattice.

- Informal Hearing re: 16 Avon Place (Capodanno) re: roof, windows. Applicant not here, incomplete application. CONA appears appropriate for some parts of project.
- Other Business
- a. Discussion re: Fees – B. Cohen did quick pass and S. Makowka did second pass. Would like everyone to look over drafts and hopefully comment by next month. D. Levy said on the fees he'd like to keep them low. S. Makowka agreed and said he added some suggestions at end of document.
- Discussion re: Design Guidelines Changes for Windows. S. Makowka asked everyone to look over after D. Baldwin's first pass on changes and we want to hold off until next month before adopting anything.
- **Old Business**
- Preservation Loan Program Update J. Worden reported APF approved loan for 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush)
 - Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtors b.
 - Status of New Commissioners
- 7. **REVIEW OF PROJECTS**
- 11 Westmoreland Avenue (Caruso 01-12M) 6/02 Cohen-COA 1.
- 2. 79 Crescent Hill (Moore, 04-5G) - Cohen-CONA
- 19 Westmoreland Ave. (Munro, 04-23M) Potter-CONA
- 4 75 Westminster Ave. (Dressler, 05-06M) - Makowka - COA
- 175 Lowell Street (Erickson for Hill, 05-07M) Cohen COA
- 15 Montague Street (Barkans, 05-08M) Cohen CONA
- 7. 105 Westminster Ave. (Orrigo – 05-27M) – Cohen – COA
- 118 Westminster Ave. (Stansbury 06-02M) Frisch COA
- 203 Lowell Street (Salocks & Stafford 06-20M) Potter COA
- 123 Westminster Ave. (Urgotis 06-26M) Makowka CONA (Front Steps)
- 12 Russell Terrace (Caritas 07-09R) Makowka CONA (Temporary Fence) 11.
- 12. 16 Maple St. (Rogers – 07-11P) – Makowka – CONA (Deck)
- 24 Irving St. (Kelly 07-14P) Makowka CONA (Windows, Sills, Porch & Balcony) 13.
- 152b Pleasant St. (Cury 07-16P) Worden COA (Fence) 14.
- 10 Montague St. (Jirak 07-20M) Makowka CONA (Fence Replacement) 15.
- 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty 07-23M) Makowka CONA (Roof & Light) 16.
- 50 Pleasant St. (Town of Arl 07-32P) Makowka COA (Wood Gutters & Fascia) 17.
- 18. 36 Jason Street (Smith – 07-37P) – Makowka – CONA (Wood Fascia & Shingles)
- 151 Lowell Street (Wyman 07-40M) Logan COA (Garage) 19.
- 20. 246 Pleasant St. (Eykamp – 07-48P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
- 21. 149 Pleasant St. (Alberto – 07-53P) – Penzenik – COA (Porch Windows)
- 22. 26-28 Jason St. (Angelakis – 07-54J) – Cohen – COA (Garage, Wall)
- 23. 23 Maple St. (Town of Arl. – 07-55P) – Makowka – COA (Trim, Siding, Vestibule, Windows)
- 24. 170 Pleasant St. (Gillis/Kelly – 07-56P) – Cohen – COA (Basement Windows)
- 25. 188 Pleasant St. (Snyder – 07-58P) – Frisch – COA (Fence & Porch Gate)
- 26. 754 Mass. Ave. (Vorlicek – 07-59J) – Makowka – 10 Day COA (Windows)
- 27. 72 Westminster Ave. (Colman – 08-01M) – Cohen – COA (Front Porch)
- 28. 54 Jason Street (Zaphiris – 08-7P) – Makowka – CONA (Front Stairs, Step & Landing)
- 29. 34 Jason Street (Szymanski – 08-09P) – Makowka – CONA (Deck on Rear)
- 30.
- 26 Academy Street (Wright 08-19P) Cohen COA (Deck, Landscaping)
- 31. 274-276 Broadway (Galvin -08-20B) – Makowka - CONA (Gutters, Roof)
- 32. 75 Pleasant Street (Congregational Church – 08-30P) – Makowka – COA (Stairway, Deck, Door)
- 33. 754 Mass. Ave. (Vorlicek – 08-31J) – Worden – COA (Handicap Lift, Stairs, Entry, Door)
- 34. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 08-33M) – Cohen – COA (porch, siding removal, stairs)
- 35.
- 175 Pleasant Street (Lucchese 08-34P) Penzenik COA (fence) 204-206 Pleasant St. (English 08-35P) Penzenik COA (windows, doorway, siding removal) 36.
- 37. 14-16 Prescott St. (Bouboulis – 08-36P) – Frisch – COA (siding removal, clapboard repair)
- 38. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng - 08-39M) - Logan - COA (ac vent, screening)
- 87 Pleasant St. (Calvert 08-40P) Makowka CONA (porch deck & railings) 39.
- 40. 21-23 Central St. (Mitchell/Dyer – 08-44C) – Frisch - COA (rear addition, stair, landing, roof)
- 41. 393-395 Mass. Ave. (Barkan – 08-45B) – Frisch - 10 Day COA (Shutters)
- 42. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 08-46M) – Penzenik – COA (Porch & Railings)
- 43. 147 Lowell Street (Nyberg – 08-47M) – Smurzynski – COA (Siding Removal & Repair)
- 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille 08-48M) Makowka CONA (Retaining Wall)

```
45.
     25 Avon Place (Smith – 09-02A) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
46.
     187 Pleasant Street (Fox – 09-03P) – Levy – COA (Window Removal, Rear Addition)
47.
     30 Jason Street (Mallio – 09-04J) – Makowka – CONA (Window Replacement)
48.
     28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 09-05P) – Makowka – COA (Chimney, Porch, AC Units, Door)
49.
     81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 09-06M) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
     187 Lowell Street (JK Construction - 09-07) - Cohen/Makowka - COA (New House, Old House)
50.
51.
     184 Westminster Ave. (Kahn – 09-10M) – Makowka – COA (Roof)
     215 Pleasant Street (Gruber - 09-11P - Levy - COA (Shed)
52.
53.
     160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson – 09-12M) – Hindmarsh – COA (Addition Revision)
54.
     156 Westminster Ave. (LaFleur/Ehlert – 09-13M) – Makowka – CONA (Driveway, Steps, Landing)
55.
     3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng – 09-17M) – Makowka – CONA (Driveway)
     179 Westminster (Cerundolo – 09-20M) – Cohen – COA (Porch, Trim, Siding Removal)
56.
57.
     187 Lowell (JK Construction – 09-21M) – Cohen/Makowka - COA (New House)
58.
     203 Lowell Street (Salocks/Stafford – 09-22M) – Makowka – COA (Addition)
     37 Jason Street (Lees - 09-24J) - Cohen - COA (Deck)
59.
60.
     74 Pleasant Street (St Johns – 09-25P) – Worden – COA (Sign & lighting)
61.
     86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 09-26P) – Makowka – 10 Day COA (shutters)
     16 Central Street (Piechota -09-28C) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
     3 Westmoreland Ave. (Eng/Canty – 09-30M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
     79 Crescent Hill Ave. (Diaz – 09-31M) – Makowka – COA (door removal, stoop, window)
     135 Pleasant Street (Doona & Irvington Trustees – 09-34P) – Makowka – 10 Day COA (Door)
     35 Central Street (Budne – 09-38C) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Chimney-Cap)
67.
     204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 09-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Rear Façade Changes)
68.
     82 Westminster Ave. (Ivers – 09-40M) – Makowka & Cohen – COA (New House Construction)
69.
     147 Lowell Street (Nyberg – 09-41M) – Smurzynski – COA (Deck)
70.
     23 Jason Street (Leary - 09-42J) - Makowka - CONA (Roof)
71.
     50 Academy Street (Barrett - 09-43C) - Makowka - CONA (Chimney, Shutters, Gutters, Facia)
72.
     148-152 Pleasant Street (White – 09-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Clapboard Siding Repair)
     14 Avon Place (Harding – 09-45A) – Makowka – CONA (Back Door, Stairs, Bulkhead)
73.
74.
     10 Montague Street (Jirak – 09-46M) – Makowka – CONA (Garage Deck Demolition)
75.
     18 Central Street (Berlinski – 09-47C) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
     17 Russell Street (Makowka – 09-48R) – Cohen – COA (Front Door Window)
76.
77.
     14 Avon Place (Harding – 09-49A) – Cohen – CONA (Windows)
78.
     14 Avon Place (Harding – 09-50A) – Cohen – COA (Deck, Stairs, Railings, Doors)
79.
     15A Avon Place (Burke – 10-01A) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters, Downspouts, Soffits, Porch, Facias, Windows)
80.
     14 Avon Place (Harding – 10-02A) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
81.
     109 Westminster Ave. (Rines/Pascale – 10-03M) – Kramer – COA (Porch)
82.
     15A Avon Place (Burke – 10-04A) – Frisch – COA (Windows)
83.
     88 Westminster Ave. (Ryan - 10-05M) - Makowka - CONA (Windows on Rear of House)
84.
     174 Westminster Ave. (Landwehr/Szaraz - 10-06M) - Makowka - CONA (Wood Window Repair)
85.
     10 Montague Street (Jirak – 10-07M) – Frisch – COA (Railings)
86.
     7 Central Street (7 Central Rlty Tr - 10-08C) - Cohen - COA (Sign)
87.
     174 Westminster Ave. (Bush/Sheldon – 10-09M) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
88.
     100 Pleasant Street (Shiffman – 10-10P) – Makowka - CONA (Roof)
89.
     45 Jason Street (Hamilton – 10-10J) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
90.
     187 Pleasant Street (Fox – 10-11P) – Makowka – CONA (Guters, Siding, Woodwork, Trim)
91.
     38 Russell Street (Mishkin – 10-12R) – Kramer – COA (AC Compressor)
92.
     23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. - 10-13P) - Makowka - CONA (Door)
93.
     17 Russell Street (Makowka/Spring – 10-14R) – Frisch – COA (Railing)
94.
     215 Pleasant Street (Gruber - 10-15P) - Penzenik - COA (Garage Door)
95.
     187 Lowell Street (J&K Construction - 10-16M) - Makowka-Cohen - COA (Ext. of Old Certif)
96.
     38 Russell St. (Mishkin – 10-17R) – Kramer – COA (Windows)
97.
     159 Pleasant Street (Krepelka – 10-18P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
98.
     15 Russell St (Wang - 10-19R) - Cohen - CONA (Roof)
99.
     215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-20P) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
     193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) - Cohen - COA (Windows, Siding)
100.
      137 Westminster Ave. (Wilcox – 10-22M) – Makowka – CONA (Siding Shingles)
```

Meeting Adjourned 10:24pm

Carol Greeley Executive Secretary cc: HDC Commissioners

102. 22 Russell Street (McCabe – 10-23R) – Cohen – CONA (Chimney)
 103. 30 Jason Street (Mallio – 10-24J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Steps)

Arlington Historical Commission, JoAnn Robinson and Richard Duffy, Co-Chairs Building Inspector, Mr. Michael Byrne
Building Dept., Richard Vallarelli
Planning Dept. and Redevelopment Board, Ms. Carol Kowalski
Massachusetts Historical Commission
Town Clerk
Robbins Library
MIS Department